

Northwest Atlantic Fisheries Organization



**Report of the NAFO Joint Commission-Scientific Council
Catch Estimation Strategy Advisory Group (CESAG) Meeting**

26 April 2018
via WebEx

NAFO
Dartmouth, Nova Scotia, Canada
2018

Report of the NAFO Joint Commission-Scientific Council Catch Estimation Strategy Advisory Group (CESAG) Meeting

26 April 2018
via WebEx

1.	Opening by the co-Chairs, Katherine Sosebee (USA) and Temur Tairov (Russian Federation).	3
2.	Appointment of Rapporteurs and Adoption of Agenda.....	3
3.	Review and finalization of 2017 Catch Estimates	3
4.	Catch Data Comparison.....	3
5.	Recommendations.....	4
6.	Other Business	4
7.	Adoption of Report	4
8.	Adjournment.....	4
	Annex 1. List of Participants	5
	Annex 2. Provisional Agenda.....	7
	Annex 3. Interim Meeting Report of CESAG, 12 March 2018 via WebEx.....	8

Report of the NAFO Joint Commission-Scientific Council Catch Estimation Strategy Advisory Group (CESAG) Meeting

26 April 2018
via WebEx

1. Opening by the co-Chairs, Katherine Sosebee (USA) and Temur Tairov (Russian Federation).

The NAFO Joint Commission-Scientific Council Catch Estimation Strategy Advisory Group (CESAG) met via WebEx on 26 April 2018. The meeting was opened at 09:00 hours (Atlantic Daylight Time) by co-Chairs, Katherine Sosebee (USA) and Temur Tairov (Russian Federation). Representatives from Canada, the European Union (EU), the Russian Federation and the United States of America (USA) participated (Annex 1).

2. Appointment of Rapporteurs and Adoption of Agenda

Tom Blasdale and Ricardo Federizon (NAFO Secretariat) were appointed co-rapporteurs.

Under “Other Matters”, an addition was made, namely, Update on MRAG Americas: *NAFO Catch Estimates Methodology Study*.

The meeting agenda is presented in Annex 2.

The Chairs noted that this meeting is a continuation of an agenda item at the last WebEx meeting of March 2018, pertaining to an evaluation of the 2017 catch estimates. The report of the March 2018 meeting is appended in Annex 3. Evaluation of the updated catch estimates would be addressed in agenda items 3 and 4.

3. Review and finalization of 2017 Catch Estimates

The Secretariat updated 2017 catch estimates of the managed stocks (for this report, “managed stocks” means fish stocks that are subject to catch limitations and are listed in Annex I.A of the NAFO Conservation and Enforcement Measures (NCEM)). They are presented in COM-SC CESAG WP 18-01 (Revised). The update incorporates additional fishing reports received by the Secretariat after the March 2018 meeting.

As in the March 2018 meeting, no significant issue was raised.

As requested, the Secretariat will include the catch estimates of alfonsinos (FAO 3-letter code ALF).

The updated catch estimates of the managed stocks and of alfonsinos will be contained in COM-SC CESAG WP 18-01 (Revised 2). As agreed, they will be forwarded to Scientific Council (SC) by May 1 (see agenda item 5).

4. Catch Data Comparison

The Secretariat presented COM-SC CESAG WP 18-04 which compares the catch data sources for all NAFO managed stocks. The data sources include Daily Catch Reports (CATs), Port inspection Reports (PSC3), Observer Reports, and Logbook reports (haul by haul reports). The working paper (WP) contains the catch estimates, for each managed stock, from the data sources mentioned above. Except for the port inspection report which contains only nominal catches, quantities of retained and rejected catches are presented. The WP also provides a summary of submission rates for the various reports received by the Secretariat, by flag State, for trips that started and ended in 2017.

The Advisory Group noted the data gaps that are highlighted in the WP, particularly the low submission rates of the 2017 haul by haul reports. For example, out of the 109 trips in 2017, only 69 trips have haul by haul reports. There were only 50 trips on which the Secretariat has received all four sources of data to date.

Concerns were expressed regarding the low submission rates of the 2017 haul by haul reports. Furthermore, to have a more up-to-date analysis of the catch data, the 60-day (after the fishing trip) submission deadline

Report of CESAG,
2018

should be shortened to 30 days. The Secretariat indicated that it has the capacity to process haul by haul reports as soon as they are received. A recommendation to address the issue of low compliance to the reporting obligations was drafted (see agenda item 5).

Regarding the port inspection reports, it was noted that the NCEM requires only at least 15% inspection coverage. If the landing includes Greenland halibut, a port inspection is required, i.e. 100% coverage. Canada indicated that, for catch estimation purpose, it can make all Canadian port inspection reports available to the Secretariat and CESAG when requested.

Regarding the March 2018 request that the percentage coverage by Division be split by flag States, the Secretariat indicated that it is a work in progress. When accomplished, it will be presented in the working paper COM-SC CESAG WP 18-02 (Revised) be uploaded in SharePoint. Participants will be informed as soon as it becomes available.

5. Recommendations

The NAFO Joint Commission-Scientific Council Catch Estimation Strategy Advisory Group (CESAG) **recommends** that:

- **The Secretariat, on behalf of CESAG, forward to Scientific Council, for consideration in its fish stock assessment work, the updated 2017 catch estimates as contained in CESAG WP 18-01 (Revised 2);**
- **Noting the specific duty of CESAG to consider and identify potential refinements of the Catch Estimate Strategy including the incorporation of haul-by-haul data within the strategy and noting the compliance issues with regards to the submission of the haul by haul reports, CESAG requests the Commission to consider some formal follow-up procedure to Contracting Parties with the aim of improving the compliance to the haul by haul submission requirement.**

6. Other Business

MRAG Americas *Catch Estimates Methodology Study*: At the last WebEx meeting, MRAG Americas was identified as the successful tenderer to perform the study. The Secretariat provides administrative input and serves as liaison between MRAG Americas and NAFO's subsidiary bodies.

The Secretariat informed the Advisory Group that MRAG Americas has commenced the undertaking of the project. The Secretariat and MRAG had an inception meeting earlier in April 2018. In accordance with the approved workplan, MRAG has started to implement the data gathering phase. They will shortly conduct interviews with NAFO scientists, at-sea-inspectors, observers, and fishery managers.

7. Adoption of Report

The meeting report was adopted by the meeting participants through correspondence.

8. Adjournment

The meeting was adjourned at 10:30 hours (Atlantic Daylight Time).

Annex 1. List of Participants

	26 April 2018	13 March 2018
CO-CHAIRS		
Tairov, Temur. (Russian Federation) Representative of the Federal Agency for Fisheries of the Russian Federation in Canada, 47 Windstone Close, Bedford, Nova Scotia, B4A4L4 Tel: +1 902 405 0655 – Email: temurtairov@mail.ru	x	x
Sosebee, Katherine (USA). Research Fisheries Biologist, NMFS Northeast Fisheries Science Center, National Marine Fisheries Service, 166 Water Street, Woods Hole, MA 02543-1026, USA Tel: +1 508 495 2372 – Email: katherine.sesebee@noaa.gov	x	x
CANADA		
Bungay, Kerry. Fisheries and Oceans Canada, Northwest Atlantic Fisheries Centre, 80 East White Hills Road, St. John's, NL A1C5X1 Tel: +1 709 772-0468 – Email: Kerry.bungay@dfo-mpo.gc.ca	x	
Fagan, Robert. Senior Analyst, Fisheries and Oceans Canada, International Programs & Corporate Services, Northwest Atlantic Fisheries Centre, 80 East White Hills Road, St. John's, NL, A1C 5X1 Tel: +1 709 772 7627 – Email: Robert.Fagan@dfo-mpo.gc.ca	x	x
Healey, Brian. Science Advisor, Fisheries and Oceans Canada, Northwest Atlantic Fisheries Centre, 80 East White Hills Road, St. John's, NL A1C5X1 Tel: +1 709 772-8674 – Email: brian.healey@dfo-mpo.gc.ca	x	x
Hurley, Mike. Fisheries and Oceans Canada, Northwest Atlantic Fisheries Centre, 80 East White Hills Road, St. John's, NL A1C5X1 Tel: +1 709 227-9344 – Email: mike.hurley@dfo-mpo.gc.ca	x	
Milburn, Derrick. Senior Advisor, International Fisheries Management and Bilateral Relations, Fisheries and Oceans Canada, 200 Kent Street, Ottawa, ON K1A 0E6 Tel: +1 613 993-7967 – Email: Derrick.Milburn@dfo-mpo.gc.ca	x	
Walsh, Ray. Regional Manager, Fisheries Management, Fisheries and Oceans Canada, 80 East White Hills Road, St. John's, NL A1C 5X1 Tel: +1 709 772 4472 – Email: ray.walsh@dfo-mpo.gc.ca	x	x
EUROPEAN UNION		
Alpoim, Ricardo. Instituto Portugues do Mar e da Atmosfera, Rua Alfredo Magalhães Ramalho, n°6, 1495-006 Lisboa, Portugal Tel: +351 213 02 70 00 – Email: ralpoim@ipma.pt	x	x
González Costas, Fernando. Instituto Español de Oceanografía (IEO), Aptdo 1552, E-36280 Vigo, Spain Tel: +34 986 49 22 39 – Email: fernando.gonzalez@ieo.es	x	x

González-Troncoso, Diana. Instituto Español de Oceanografía (IEO), Aptdo 1552, E-36280 Vigo, Spain Tel: +34 986 49 21 11 – Email: diana.gonzalez@ieo.es	x	x
Ivanescu, Raluca. NAFO Desk Officer, European Commission, Regional Fisheries Management Organisations, DG-MARE B2, Rue Joseph II, 99, B-1049, Brussels, Belgium Email: Raluca.IVANESCU@ec.europa.eu		x
Rodriguez-Alfaro, Sebastián, International Affairs, European Commission, Scientific Advice and Data Collection, DG-MARE C3, Rue Joseph II, 99, 1000 Brussels, Belgium Tel: +32 2295 4043 – Email: Sebastian.RODRIGUEZ-ALFARO@ec.europa.eu	x	
RUSSIAN FEDERATION Tairov, Temur (see above)	x	x
UNITED STATES OF AMERICA Sosebee, Katherine (see above)	x	x
NAFO SECRETARIAT 2 Morris Drive, Suite 100, Dartmouth, Nova Scotia, Canada – Tel: +1 902 468-5590		
Kingston, Fred. Executive Secretary. Email: fkingson@nafo.int	x	x
Goodick, Stan. Deputy Executive Secretary & Senior Finance and Staff Administrator. Email: sgoodick@nafo.int		x
Blasdale, Tom. Scientific Council Coordinator. Email: tblasdale@nafo.int	x	x
Federizon, Ricardo. Senior Fisheries Management Coordinator. Email: rfederizon@nafo.int	x	
Aker, Jana. Fisheries Information Administrator. Email: jaker@nafo.int	x	x
Laycock, D.J. Database Developer/Programmer Analyst. Email: dlaycock@nafo.int	x	
Glindtvad, Sebastian. NAFO Intern	x	

Annex 2. Agenda

1. Opening by the co-Chairs
2. Appointment of Rapporteurs and Adoption of the Agenda
3. Review and finalization of the 2017 Catch Estimates
4. Catch Data Comparison
5. Recommendations
6. Other Business
7. Adoption of Report
8. Adjournment

Annex 3. Interim Meeting Report of the NAFO Joint Commission-Scientific Council Catch Estimation Strategy Advisory Group (CESAG), 12 March 2018 via WebEx

(COM-SC WP 18-03)

1. Opening by the co-Chairs

The NAFO Joint Commission-Scientific Council Catch Estimation Strategy Advisory Group (CESAG) met via WebEx on 12 March 2018. The meeting was opened at 08:00 hours (Atlantic Daylight Time) by co-Chairs Katherine Sosebee (USA) and Temur Tairov (Russian Federation). Representatives from Canada, the European Union (EU), the Russian Federation and the United States of America (USA) were in attendance (Annex 1).

2. Appointment of Rapporteur and Adoption of the Agenda

The Scientific Council Coordinator (Tom Blasdale) was appointed as rapporteur.

The agenda was adopted as circulated (Annex 2).

3. Identification of a contractor to perform the Catch Estimates Methodology Study

At the 39th Annual Meeting, the Commission adopted the project proposal Catch Estimates Methodology Study (NAFO COM Doc. 17-25). A Call for Tender was finalized following the November 2017 meeting of CESAG and advertised and circulated to potential contractors by the Secretariat in January 2018.

In response to this advertisement, a single proposal was received (from MRAG Americas). This was circulated to CESAG members by email in preparation for the present meeting.

It was agreed that the proposal appeared to satisfy all of the evaluation criteria developed by CESAG during its November 2017 meeting. The only concern was a potential conflict of interest resulting from one member of the project team (Michael Sissenwine) being a NAFO delegate. The tenderers have acknowledged this as a potential concern but stated that Dr. Sissenwine would not be a leading member of the project team. None of the meeting participants raised any objections on the ground of conflict.

The EU raised the concern that the role of the SC in this study had not been made sufficiently clear in the proposal: the proposal states that interim results will be presented to the SC June meeting but nothing further. In addition, the EU recalled that involvement of scientific observers is important. CESAG agreed a greater degree of engagement with SC will be required, possibly including a further presentation at the September meeting. It was agreed that the proposal will be accepted subject to the insertion of the following wording:

During their meeting with the Scientific Council (SC) in June 2018, the contractor will agree with SC the role of the SC and its members in the development of the project.

4. Evaluation of the preliminary 2017 catch estimates derived following the revised Catch Estimation Strategy (COM-SC Doc. 17-08)

The NAFO Secretariat (Jana Aker) presented preliminary results of applying the methods outlined in the revised Catch Estimation Strategy (COM-SC Doc. 17-08) to all NAFO managed stocks. This work was presented in three working papers. In the first (COM-SC CESAG-WP 18-01), preliminary catch estimates following the Catch Estimation Strategy were presented broken down by flag State and NAFO Division. Catch estimates derived from port inspection data and Daily catch reports, and the daily catch reports were presented for comparison. The second working paper (COM-SC CESAG-WP 18-02) showed the percentage of catch data from port inspections for which it was possible to assign catches according to division, and the third (COM-SC CESAG-WP 18-03) presented weight of catches inspected in ports as a percentage of CAT weight.

CESAG members raised a few minor points of clarification but no significant concerns were raised.

The EU asked whether it would be possible to compare the values derived through the Catch Estimation Strategy with the haul by hauls data, given that SC in 2016 requested that catch estimates should be from haul by hauls. The Secretariat responded that the 2017 haul by haul data is unlikely to be complete at the present time.

Canada requested that for the next meeting the percentage coverage by division should be split by flag State and the Secretariat undertook to do this.

The next steps in completing this work will be comparison with haul by haul and inclusion of any new data received up to 1 April 2018.

5. Recommendations

This agenda item was deferred to the next Advisory Group meeting.

6. Other Business

No other matters were raised under this agenda item.

7. Adjournment

A further meeting of CSAG will be held in late April to evaluate the final results of this work. The Secretariat will run a doodle poll for to identify appropriate dates in late April.

The meeting closed at 08:45 hours (Atlantic Daylight Time).